RESEARCH PAPER

Fragmented Selves: Archetypal Journeys and Unattained Individuation in Moinuddin's Women in 'Provide, Provide'

¹Anbreen Akhtar Khan, ²Dr. Haniya Munir and ³Atif Hayat

1. Visiting Lecturer, Department of English, Thal University Bhakkar, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Lecturer, Department of English, The Women University Multan, Punjab, Pakistan
3. Lecturer, Department of English, Thal University Bhakkar, Punjab, Pakistan

Corresponding Author:	munirjahangir786@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study explores the inner fragmentation of the women portrayed in Moinuddin's *"Provide, Provide,"* focusing on how their journeys toward self-realization remain painfully incomplete. Limited to selected female characters in the story, the research draws on Carl Jung's concept of archetypes and individuation to understand how these women struggle between personal longing and social expectation. Using a qualitative approach and close textual analysis, the study uncovers how figures such as the nurturing caregiver and the self-sacrificing mother are not merely roles they perform, but identities imposed upon them. The findings suggest that their fractured sense of self does not arise from personal weakness, but from the quiet, persistent pressures of a patriarchal environment that denies them autonomy and emotional wholeness. Their failure to achieve individuation reflects a deeper cultural reality where duty overshadows desire and silence replaces self-expression. Ultimately, the study recommends further exploration of similar patterns in Pakistani Anglophone fiction and encourages blending psychoanalytic and feminist perspectives to better understand the muted struggles of women seeking wholeness within restrictive social structures. However, sometimes at the certain point in time, they refuse to submit to the standards of the society by confronting their inner conflicts and reach the stage of individuation leading them to be hero of their lives. This study contributes to the development of a general understanding of human behaviors in relevance to their social and cultural circumstances through examining these repeated patterns.

KEYWORDS	Carl Jung's Theory of Archetypes, Archetypal Analysis, Collective Unconscious, Moinuddin's Exploration Of Archetypes, In Other Rooms Other Wonders, Provide, Provide

Introduction

The portrayal of female characters is complex in literature and reflects the social values, expectations and archetypal representation of women. Daniyal Moinuddin has crafted many female characters however, within the framework of Carl Jung's theory of archetypes, a comprehensive examination of these female characters is regained. The research aims to investigate the archetypal patterns, and roles of female characters influenced by cultural and social expectations in selected short story *Provide, Provide* by Daniyal Moinuddin. By exploring these archetypal patterns and roles, this study is carried out to illuminate significant archetypal analysis in the interpretation of female characters in contemporary literature. In her article, Neary (2009) stated about Moinuddin: "The author says he sees himself as somewhat of a translator, interpreting life in a remote Pakistan for western audience. But he notes that he lives between two cultures – and is not really a part of either".

Analytical Psychology, also referred as Jungian analysis is term coined by the Swiss psychiatrist Carl Jung. He designed it to distinguish his work from Sigmund Freud psychoanalytic theories as their collaboration of seven-year came to an end in between 1912 to1913. The evolution of his theory is contained in his opus Collected Works which was written in his life span of almost sixty years. His theory is basically biographical and this theory initially concerned psychological complexes but after breaking up with Freud, this became a generalized method of investigating unconscious and the archetypes. It was a foundation for multiple developments in the practice and study of psychology. His theory gave rise to multidisciplinary literature. Some commentators view his wide-progression in analytical psychotherapy influenced by his intuition evolved into art in comparison to scientific approach. The findings and applications of Jungian analysis to social and familial relationships, urban planning and architecture, warfare etc. are all elaborated in several films and publications. Carl Gustav Jung identified two separate aspects of his self and he called them as number 1 and number 2 personalities. According to him, his No. 1 personality was extraverted and tuned to the objective world while his No. 2 personality was introverted and was tuned to his inward or subjective world. Jung went through the period of "creative illness" in his late30s or Early 40s when he began his search of Self, as a result of his split with his spiritual father, Sigmund Freud. Jung's analytical theory contains the various levels of the Psyche among which are Conscious, Personal Unconscious, and Collective Unconscious. He says that some elements in the collective unconscious become highly developed and they are called archetypes. According to him, Archetypes are archaic images and have biological basis that actually, originate through the repeated experiences of human early ancestors. As Salyer (2012) puts:

> "Archetypes are inherited, facilitate survival, and are adaptive
> like instincts. But archetypes activate the spirit and imbue
> meaning as they are experienced. They are intuited automatically
> as their symbolic forms come to light and they up deep feelings,
> emotional reverberation that is unrelated to thinking but, related
> to knowing."

Dreams are considered as the main source of archetypal materials however; hallucinations of psychic patients also offer evidence of universal archetypes. He proposed the archetypes of persona, shadow, anima, animus, great mother, wise old man, hero and self.

Types of Archetypes

The Persona: It is the mask that allows making contact with the external world but this is not the rigid one and is flexible enough to act as a regulator between the inner and outer worlds.

The Shadow: The part of our personality that holds the desires that are repressed either because they are evil, unacceptable, our shortcomings, or considered as weaknesses by the society.

The Animus: The notion of masculinity in women portraying the characteristics of opposite sex.

Adamski (2011) is of the view that Jung identified three psychic levels in human personality; the conscious which is formed by the content received through four mental

functions, the personal conscious and the collective unconscious which hoards shared universal experiences that humans inherit and are common across cultures.

Literature Review

Jamshidi et al. (2023) discuss archetypal criticism as a valuable text-based approach in literary analysis. Their article emphasized the importance of understanding and critiquing archetypes in comparative literature research to prevent undue influence from other works and to facilitate meaningful cross-cultural analysis. They are of the view that collective unconscious theory in psychology aims to clarify why, despite diverse conscious thoughts, individuals become more similar when viewed from the unconscious perspective. Exploring universal symbols, or archetypes, derived from the collective unconscious may uncover common threads in psychopathologies globally. Analyzing how mythology communicated aspects of metal and behavioral disorders in societies before formal psychology and modern diagnoses, reveals a historical outlet for psychological exploration. In this thesis, the focus was on illustrating the importance of myth and literature as reservoirs of archetypes for individuals.

The main characters in *Warm Bodies* film using Jung Theory of Archetypes to find six archetypes in the main characters of the film, R and Julie were analyzed by Rizakiyah et al. (2018). They found the development R character from Zombie to a human being since he fell in love with Julie. Thus, he proposed that archetypes are part of individual that helps the process of development of the character.

Rahman et al. (2023) state that in Sethi's '*Tomboy*' (2021), the utilization of archetypes provides profound insights into the characters' motivations and actions, shedding light on the underlying forces steering their behavior. By exploring archetypes such as the Anima and Animus, Shadow, The Great Mother, Self, and Persona, readers gain a nuanced understanding of the characters' psychological dynamics. This comprehension transcends surface-level meanings, allowing readers to delve into the subconscious realms of the characters' desires, fears, and aspirations. Through archetype analysis, the researcher uncovers the intricate layers of the characters' psyche and the motivations shaping their actions throughout the narrative. Examining specific archetypes in myths and their potential links to psychological diagnoses aims to validate Jung's theory of the collective unconscious. By showcasing these connections, the intention is to prompt readers to consider the possible interplay between human psychology and its influence on literature and mythology (Covington, 2018).

Turyalayet. al. (2023) investigated the oppression and suppression of women through patriarchal institutions and the reasons of women permission to take advantage of them. Gayatri Spivak's feminist theory showed that various institutions of women such as womanhood, wifehood and mechanisms such as lack of education, language and economic dependency are enforced by patriarchy. The women in *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* were maltreated, objectified, oppressed and victimized at the hands of patriarchy for their own benefit and they take advantage of the socially built patriarchal institution sand mechanisms. Women also face suppression for the lack of awareness of their basic rights in the male dominant society.

Material and Methods

This study adopts a qualitative textual analysis approach. The research is interpretative and analytical in nature, focusing on close reading of the selected short

story *Provide, Provide* from In Other Rooms, Other Wonders by Daniyal Mueenuddin. The study seeks to investigate the underlying patterns of behavior and meanings within the data to dig out the subjective narrative surrounding the various archetypes identified by Carl Jung as a theoretical framework. This research considers interpreting the female characters in the contemporary Pakistani literature through the patterns and symbols associated with them. The interpretations are subjective in nature with relation to the society in which the researcher lives and the stories have been structured.

Results and Discussions

Moinuddin's short story Provide, Provide enfolds in itself various Jungian archetypes that shape the behaviors of the female characters of either class under study as at one point in time, they were struggling to seek approval of their characters by switching to Jung's persona and on the other moment they were fighting their inner turmoil thus an interplay of various archetype appeared in stories while examination. There was a constant struggle inside the character's rooms of psyche to attain individual selves. The interpreter dealt with the collected data of archetypal patterns in the psyche of female characters in the short story.

The Persona

Gusti (2022) opines that Persona is the individual's adaptation to or is the manner of how he deals with the outer world. It is a mask that actors wear on stage as they have to act in a certain manner that really doesn't belong to them. People wear this mask to make impressions on other people or to hide their real identities. This is actually a balance between the person himself and the society to act normally among the people.

In Provide, Provide, the inner turmoil of Zainab's personality from the always available woman to the landlord to becoming reserved when they have quarrel is actually the expression of the archetype of persona as she has adapted herself according to the situation is under the influence of archetype of persona. "Each time he met her she approached him with the same reserve she had displayed the first time she saw her". (p.49) If this instance is interpreted in Pakistani context, a woman is expected to stay reserved in the company of strangers, therefore it can be interpreted as an attempt to mask their relationship as strangers to record her protest against Jaglani's attempt of emotionally disrespecting her by considering her as a materialistic woman.

Another instance of Persona was observed again in Zainab's statement when despite being angry with Jaglani, Zainab fulfilled his sexual desires whenever he needed her in the bed. Therefore, when she is enquired by him if she was afraid of villagers and thus was reserved, she replied that all the villagers were aware of their relationship since the first day but they didn't badmouth as Jaglani was the influential person and villagers were afraid of the consequences of defaming him. This shows her action of masking herself by being Jaglani's mistress to avoid societal judgement as Tavernise (2009) puts: "His characters are…….; and servant girls desperate to improve their station in life". "Then I will be your whore. At least now we still pretend it." (p.49)

The Shadow

Gusti (2022) opines that Shadow holds the repressed unfulfilled desires as they are either evil or antagonize the societal expectations. They are the individual's

weaknesses which he hides from others. The individuals sometime project these tendencies onto others under the influence of shadow archetype to predict evil.

Zainab's encounter with the shadow archetype occurred when she confessed that she used to consider Aslam, her ex-husband, as infertile for not having children however, marrying Jaglani and still not having children made her realize that it was her own weakness, she solely attributed to Aslam as this rejected aspect of herself exerted influence on her thoughts and behaviors manifesting in indirect way. But her realization of her own reproductive's shortcomings arose guilt in her which made her cry. "You know, I thought I didn't have children with Aslam because he couldn't. But it's me.' She almost began to cry". (p.55)

Zainab's 'wilderness' and 'contained violence' can be treated by the archetype of Shadow. As she married Jaglani, she gradually started losing interest in making love with him and didn't welcome his actions and disengaged smiling as soon as he made such attempts. As a representative of the unconscious psyche, repressed desires and negative tendencies, it is the shadow archetype of Zainab that forced her wilderness out by cutting her toenails too far to bleed. Perhaps, she regrets marrying an old man and for her catharsis she cuts her nail too far to depict her unconscious expression of sabotaging her personality. This instance mirrors the inner and outer conflict and fragmentation of human psyche.

> "She cut her toenails one day, but too far, into the quick, an
> inverted half-moon, until one of the nails bled. He loved this
> wilderness in her, evidence of hardness towards herself,
> contained violence". (p.54)

Jaglani's senior wife quickly grew old after discovering about his second marriage, although their marriage was arranged and Jaglani didn't ever develop any love bond with her but it didn't make any difference to her earlier. However, his second marriage developed a sense of rejection in her and her inner turmoil of the traumatic feeling of being abandoned is expressed in the form of reactions like growing old, staying in bed for long time, not taking care of herself and becoming rounded like a hoop. "His senior wife had never reproached him, but after Jaglani told her she quickly became old. She prayed a great deal, spent much of her time in bed, stopped caring for herself." (p.60)

Animus

Animus according to Munir et al. (2024) is the male perspective in female psyche and it represents the authority, resilience, and rationality. The first time, Zainab invokes the animus to assert her independence and her self-respect. She rejects Jaglani's offer of material possession when they have quarrel in the bed and he attempts to reconcile with her by offering her money and material things. Her response is a strong expression of her inner strength and a refusal to be under control of the external factors such as materialistic means and when the animus overwhelms her psyche; she becomes loud and blunt. "You buy me things and then later you'll think you bought me. I was never for sale,' she replied, standing up". (p.48)

Mother

Archetype of Mother has two aspects; Great Mother and Terrible Mother. First instance of Great Mother archetype occurs when an incident of snakebite happens in

Jaglani's village and when he reaches the house of the victim child, he observes child's mother crying, seeing her son in severe pain. This is an expression the Great Mother Archetype which according to De Coster (2010) symbolizes the protection, nourishment, growth and nurturing.. "The woman quietly sobbing and dabbing at her eyes with her head scarf". (p.50)

Zainab's character also represents the Great Mother archetype as nurturing and nourishing force which is the universal aspect of motherhood. Zainab's protectiveness of the child is apparent by the phrase 'gently washed the baby' in the short story which also aligns with the care giving and providing comfort to the kid as the inherent characteristics of all mothers. It is similar to the instance at the beginning of the same story where the mother can't emotionally accept the death of her child who died of the venomous bite of the snake and her falling on her child's corpse crying, 'no, no, no, no' is her protective trait. "Zainab leaned against a pillow and, dipping a cloth into a bowl of warm water, gently washed the baby". (p.57)

Fragmentation of Zainab's personality

"Zainab wept quietly and kept saying to herself, "And they didn't even offer me a cup of tea"." (pg.65) This shows fragmentation or failure to achieve individuation as she stays stuck in the shadow archetype which happens when a person can't encounter the fragmented aspects of its psyche.

Conclusion

Hence above discussion claims that unattained struggle to assert authority, or fragmented selves have a severe impact on human psychological health, eventually leaving a person helpless as in Zainab's case. Moreover, the researchers reach the conclusion by giving answers to the questions posed in the beginning of the study and discussed above producing definite depictions of Archetypal patterns resulting in the collective unconscious and archetypal resonance as Covington (2018) stated: "By showcasing these connections, the intention is to prompt readers to consider the possible interplay between human psychology and its influence on literature and mythology". It also represents the cultural and social context that dictates the actions of female characters in a particular way in male dominated societies where women have to struggle mentally and physically to assert their authority. Moinuddin through his stories explored archetypes such as Persona, Shadow, Animus, the mother archetype; least focused by Jung. However, not a single instance showing Zainab's realization of Self was found thus instantiates that Zainab failed to encounter the fragmented aspects of her personality. The story proves that Moinuddin has a deep understanding of the Pakistani culture and its profound effects on the individuals.

References

Adamski, A. (2011). Archetypes and the collective unconscious of Carl G. Jung in the light ofquantum psychology. *NeuroQuantology*, *9*(3), 563-571.

Covington, L. (2018). Applying Jung's Archetypes and Theory of the Collective Unconscious to Ovid's Metamorphoses.

De Coster, P. L. (2010). *The collective unconscious and its archetypes.* Meditation Triangle Units, Gent: SatsangPress.

Gusti, A. I., &Asiyah, N. (2022). *Jung's Archetypes as found in Polly Gray Character in Peaky Blinders TV Series* (Doctoral dissertation, FAB/SI).

Jamshidi, R., Ghasemipour, G., &Abshirini, A. (2023). Archetypal Criticism: Theories and Approaches. *Literary Arts*, *15*(1), 19-48.

Mueenuddin, D., (2010) In Other Rooms, Other Wonders (electronic ed.). Soho Square, London: Bloomsbury Publishing Pic.

Munir, H., Liaqat, S., & Khan, A. A. (2024). Echos of the Unconscious: Archetypal Exploration in Manto's 'Toba Tek Singh'. *Jahan e Tahqeeq*, 7(1), 405-410.

Neary, L. (2009, March 6). *Pakistani-American writer bridges two worlds*. NPR. Retrieved from https://www.npr.org/

Rahman, S. U., Haider, G., Ullah, W., & Jan, S. A. U. (2023). A Study of Gender and Societal Analysis of Sethi's Tomboy (2021) from Jungian Archetypal Perspective. *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, *20*(2), 1082-1089.

Rizakiah, S., Sili, S., &Kuncara, S. D. (2018). An Analysis of Main Character In Warm Bodies Film Using Jung Theory of Archetypes. *Samarinda: Mulawarman University*.

Salyer, M. (2012). Jungian Archetypes in Advertising Imagery. *Utopian Images and Narratives in Advertising: Dreams for Sale*, 111-140.

Tavernise, S. (2009, July 24). Tales from Rural Pakistan, Lived and Shared [Blog Post]. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2009/07/25/world/asia/25pstan.html

Turyalay, G. A., Zia, A. &Ullah, Z. (2023). Analysis of DaniyalMueenuddin's "In Other Rooms, Other Wonders": A Feministic View. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom, 2*(2).