



RESEARCH PAPER

Navigating the Threat Landscape: A Study on Counter-terrorism Measures in Pakistan

¹Dr. Aatir Rizvi*, ²Dr. Ahmed Raza Khan and ³Muhammad Manzoor Elahi

1. Professor, Superior College of Law, Superior University, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.
2. Assistant Professor, Department of International Relations, Government College University Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
3. Lecturer, Department of Political Science, Government College University Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan, Punjab, Pakistan

***Corresponding Author:** aatir.rizvi@superior.edu.pk

Abstract

Pakistan, unfortunately, has been a victim of both extremism and terrorism for the past three decades. It is mainly due to Pakistan's geostrategic compulsions as well as bad domestic policies and lack of commitment by the policy elites. The aftermath of September 11 and the joining of War on Terror by the then President, as a front-line state, further brought perils for the country, the jolts of which are still visible. Pakistan needs proper policy making and pragmatic approach to handle the situation and further, proactive foreign and domestic policies must be adopted, along-with intelligence sharing mechanisms to counter this religious extremism and terrorism. There is dire need to address the internal factors like socio-economic inequality, political disorder, corruption, poverty and bad governance at priority basis, along-with start of national dialogue with all the stakeholders to reach at some sort of consensus for the national security purposes.

Key Words Extremism, Militancy, National Security, Terrorism, Violence

Introduction

There has been a nexus between extremism and terrorism, as both are interrelated due to the tendencies of followers of extremist ideologies to resort for terrorist activities, sooner or later. This menace of terrorism is not the recent phenomenon, but is the result of decades' old bad governance, faulty foreign policy, mishandling of internal population and keeping blind eye towards extremist literatures, ideologies and parties. The law and order situation becomes a hurdle when it comes to international outlook of the country and international investors and businesses do not invest, whereas, local manufacturers and businesses start looking for some safer environments abroad for their factories and outlets; and this is what Pakistan is facing for the last three decades or so. Unless there is domestic harmony, foreign relations cannot be bettered. The stringent laws and proper implementation of rule of law is the need of the time. The extremist ideologies have many shapes; they might emerge from culture, religion, racial superiority complexes and literature imparting such concepts among the masses, even the role of social, print and electronic media cannot be overlooked in the spread of such ideologies, advertently or inadvertently. In this article only religious extremism and counter terrorism efforts and strategies will be discussed, alongwith some of the recommendations to counter these tendencies in Pakistani context, as extremism breeds terrorism, and in this global age, where distances don't matter and technology is accessible for everyone, the things have become more complicated and terrorist networks and their financing has taken unique and unprecedented shapes, which need modern mindset, cooperation and technology to curb and shun. Hence, Pakistan has to understand that all international counter terrorism efforts are in one way or another politically motivated and here diplomacy and role of friendly nations come to rescue, in which Pakistan is lagging behind. It is also pertinent

to mention here that till date, there is no consensus upon the definition of terrorism, which sometimes leads to ambiguity and at other times to an overreaction, yet actions against terrorism still continue and have never been postponed due to this ambiguity. It is important to note that all states are interdependent in this era and they need to understand that peace in one state is the guarantee of peace in the other, so in order to avoid anarchic situations, cooperation and intelligence sharing is good option, rather than intervention in the name of countering terrorism. Hence, successful counter terrorism operations are always by local law enforcement agencies, designed while keeping in mind the domestic environment and ground realities of that area. The issue of terror funding remains a real security risk for Pakistan. This extremism does not powerless critic but also needs an approach by the legislature to demonstrate that state is serious in this regard.

Literature Review

Before going into the details about threat, causes and policy decisions in order to counter extremism issue, let us try to explain what 'extremism' really means. Defining a term is not only necessary for a shared understanding but also for the development of potential response. However, as situations may differ so they need to be understood in a particular context. *Extremism* is vocal or active opposition to fundamental values, including democracy, the rule of law, individual liberty and mutual respect and tolerance of different faiths and beliefs (Kundani, 2015). This extremism calls for the death of innocent people and army personnel leading to anarchic situation in the country. This extremism has its roots in many aspects; it might be religious, social, political and economic disparity. However, West has also devised a terminology called, '*Islamic Extremism*' which can be described as, an ideology, due to distorted interpretations of Islamic principles by scholars like Syed Qutub, through which Western intervention is considered as war on Islam and a narrative has been created as, them versus us. Hence, for them global Islamic state is a must, which is to be governed by Sharia as against democracy and liberalism and for them if a Muslim does not agree with their ideology, that person is either not a true Muslim or has become non-Muslim (Report of Task Force on Tackling Radicalization and Extremism).

Hence, *religious extremism* is the ideology of those religious groups which consider that their concepts are superior to others. *Webster's New Pocket Dictionary* states, extremism is the ideology which is not moderate i.e. it is being extreme as in politics and religion etc. whereas, violent extremism tends to recruit likeminded people, advocating such thoughts and making preparations and supporting to justify violence (USAID Policy). This type of extremism can work, both at individual level or group level or can be preplanned or unplanned too. These extremists can exist in stable environments too. There have been various definitions and aspects of terrorism (Mehdi, M, p-4). The strategies and political situations along-with actors are the ones which determine the terms terror, terrorism and terrorist (Charles, T. p-5). The result of terrorism is mass killing, destruction of infrastructure, destabilization of region, economic downfall and destruction of institutions. The *Oxford English Dictionary* defines terrorism as, "policy intended to strike with terror those against whom it is adopted". September 11 was the turning point from which terrorism become a global issue and Pakistan being neighboring state of Afghanistan become center of attraction for both fighting the war on terror and those who were being labeled as terrorists, so Pakistan suffered the most than gaining benefit from the situation. AP Schmid, UN advisor, found twenty two similarities in all the definitions of terrorism and provided one comprehensive definition i.e.

"Terrorism is an anxiety inspiring method of repeated violent action, employed by (semi-) clandestine individual, group or state actors, for idiosyncratic, criminal or

political reasons, whereby --- in contrast to assassination --- the direct targets of violence are not the main targets. The immediate human victims of violence are generally chosen randomly (targets of opportunity) or selectively (representative of symbolic targets) from a target population, and serve as message generators. Threat—and violence--- based communication possesses between terrorist (organization), (imperiled) victims, and main targets are used to manipulate the main target (audience[s]), turning it into a target of terror, a target of demands, or a target of attention depending on whether intimidation, coercion, or propaganda is primary sought”

Mehdi, M (p-1) thinks it is September 11 which brought the old phenomenon of terrorism into attention of US and its allies. In short, almost all definitions of terrorism hinge on five determinant elements; (a) violence; (b) perpetrator; (c) motive; (d) victim; and (e) audience (Mehdi M. p-4). The terrorism has transformed during the recent past and the new terrorism is both political and religious at the same time. However, terrorists still rely on conventional arms and means (Isabelle D, p-447). Surprise, provocation and publicity are what the terrorists are after.

Material and Methods

This study utilizes qualitative research design to examine the effectiveness of counter terrorism measures in Pakistan. Mainly, it aims to gain a comprehensive and nuanced understanding of the counter terrorism situation in Pakistan by analyzing works, reports, and policy documents from various sources under critical approach. Through content analysis the study seeks to identify recurring patterns and significant themes in the existing literature and reports.

Additionally, this approach allows for an evaluation of the development challenges faced and successes achieved by counter terrorism strategies. Moreover, this study intends to contribute insights to both discussions and policy deliberations on counter terrorism efforts, in Pakistan while shedding light on the complexities involved in addressing contemporary threats.

Results and Discussion on Expansion of Terrorism and Extremism

Terrorist activities are now very common throughout the world, whether it be developed countries like USA and UK or underdeveloped ones. All the continents are confronting such activities due to many types of extremisms prevailing globally. The South Asian states are not exception to this terrorism and neighboring states have been at the constant threat due to this unstable situation as, an unfortunate event in one place definitely affects negatively other states. Therefore, an integrated approach at regional level is a must to counter terrorism. Most of the terrorist organizations have global reach and for them the borders among states are meaningless, as they take help from the extremist ideologies prevailing in each state or among each religious segment to fulfill their goals. Hence, despite all the individual as well as, collective efforts by different governments, terrorism has not been curtailed, rather it is on its rise; it is just changing its form, outlook, location and profile.

Islamic militancy especially in Pakistan, Afghanistan, India (even Hindutva doctrine for Hindus) and Bangladesh; the Red Corridor in Nepal and India; situation of Afghan border with Pakistan and LTTE in Sri Lanka are some of the shapes of terrorism in South Asia. Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and Tehrik-e-Taliban Afghanistan, Al-Qaida, East Turkistan Islamic Movement (ETIM), the Islamic State (IS), the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan (IMU), Hizbul Tehreer (HT), Lashkar-e-Jhangwi and other

militant factions in Afghanistan and Pakistan are some of the prominent terrorist organizations operating and having regional impact and linkages.

If we look at the recent terrorist attacks in the region, we will come to know that terrorism has intensely grown in the recent past and terrorists have become more advanced in technology and their tactics have become more sophisticated. They are not only using advanced weapons, but also devising new ways to attack to attain more attention from local, regional as well as, international audience. They are now attacking indiscriminately, using young ones, women, educated and uneducated perpetrators alike, making the terrorist landscape more diverse, dynamic and unpredictable. Cyber terrorism is their latest weapon. South Asia is witnessing the most deadly terrorist violence of this time; whether it is in terms of casualties or devastation. Hence, to combat extremism leading to terrorism has become the biggest political challenge for all the leaders and it will remain so in the coming years. The stubborn attitude, of different states towards each other in this region on different burning issues, is also playing important role in spreading extremist views and terrorism, such as Indo-Pak relations and policies on Kashmir issue, Sino-India issues and alike, where heroes for one state are the terrorists for the other. These conflicting interpretations of terrorism and terrorist activities are giving strategic room to terrorist groups to spread their extremist agenda among masses and increase their influence day by day. Further, lack of political will to prosecute the terrorist organizations in these areas by the opposing state is also a cause for the spread of terrorism. One of the major issues at regional level is the presence of terrorist camps in different states, which have been badly criticized by neighboring state/s, as being allegedly used against it. Such as, India has issues with its neighbors like Bhutan, Nepal etc. regarding support of terrorist organizations. Pakistan blames India helping terrorists in Balochistan through Afghanistan; Sri Lanka blames India regarding its help to Tamil terrorists. So, it has become hard to evolve a uniform counter terrorism strategy at regional level in South Asia. SAARC has adopted many resolutions, conventions and protocols to curb terrorism and has given emphasis on national counter terrorism measures and regulations. Additional measures can be taken in the form of intelligence sharing, regional anti-money laundering laws to counter terror financing, regional capacity building, coordination among law enforcement agencies, joint counter terrorism exercises and by taking proactive approach in the region. Further, there is dire need to build the trust among states as it is common phenomenon that a terrorist for one state is usually a proxy for the other.

States can respond to terrorism in number of ways; they can give concessions to those who have moral cause for their activities or where state thinks it is reasonable to talk, and it can resort to military intervention in case its civil authorities have failed to tackle the issue. These individual efforts can be linked at regional level through cooperation and extraditing the criminals to states where they have performed the acts of terrorism.

Al-Qaida claims to establish its branches in Indian sub-continent and this is evident through the release of different videos it has released in the past as well as, the hijacking of a Pakistani naval ship PNS Zulfiqar in 2014 and their attempt to use that ship against US vessels in the Arabian Sea. Apart from Al-Qaida, IS has also emerged recently which, unlike Al-Qaida wants to occupy land to establish Khalafat, once occupied about 1/3rd of total oil wells as well as, a large land in Iraq and Syria, hence started working as a de facto state. This IS is posing more threat to this region as many of the extremist and terrorist organizations working independently in Pakistan and in South Asia have begun to announce their support to IS without formally joining them. This development is posing serious threat to regional harmony in South Asia and directly affecting Pakistan and its national security, as these have unleashed new proxy wars in this region, where

one can find neighboring states in support and against emerging principalities. This IS has shown its presence in Pakistan through wall chalking, distribution of pamphlets and other extremist literature and material in different areas of KPK and Balochistan. Hussain, Z. (2015) is of the view that IS has increased its influence in Pakistan and this is evident from the Hazara killings, as many Taliban have joined IS due to military operations against them, whereas, Pakistani government always denies their presence in Pakistan.

Irrespective of the fact that Pakistan recognizes its presence or not, IS is now considered to be the largest militant, extremist and ideological threat not only to Pakistan but also to the whole world, as it has its recruiters all over the Western as well as, Eastern world. They are smart, educated, up to date and sophisticated. They preach their extremist views through social media or through their supporters already present in different Muslim and non-Muslim countries. The issue is now transnational and global one.

Typology of Terrorism

Terrorism in Pakistan has up till now been understood, either as a element of the region's multiple conflicts, separatist groups, ideological orientations and nationalist discourses or as component of state-sponsored proxy wars. The 9/11 terrorist attack in USA changed the fate of regional stability on the ground realities of terrorism. The following types assume importance in understanding the form of terrorism and can be bifurcated under two major domains of terrorism.

- Conventional Typology of Terrorism: It covers proxy wars, state sponsored terrorism, separatist terrorism, religious terrorism, left-wing terrorism.
- Non-Conventional Typology of Terrorism. It encompasses within its purview cyber terrorism, nuclear terrorism, Eco-terrorism, Narco-terrorism and Bio-terrorism.

State Terrorism: A type of terrorism in which government tries to have power over its population and over the enemy territory. State terrorism is completely carried out by the authority in a state. The French Revolution can be eluded as the first illustration of state terrorism. Though, monarchs have most likely been practiced it for centuries, to control their rule and subject. Hence, dictators also convicted state terrorism such as Saddam Hussein, who exercised his power to suppress the Kurds and democratic activists. Additionally, in case of India and Pakistan, the incidents of Parliament Attack, Mumbai Attack, Kashmir conflict, Palwama Incident etc. are considered under state sponsored terrorism.

Religious Terrorism: Terrorism can also be provoked by religious accusations and ideological dogmas. Religious terrorism is completely achievable by religious teachings. Suicide bombing is the most heinous act of this type of terrorism (Kavosh 2015). In the south Asian region, Al-Qaeda is probably the most renowned example of a religious group that can be recognized as religious terrorists group (Sedgwick 2004). In addition, the RSS, Shive Sina and Hindutava followers are also provoking religious hatred.

Left-Wing terrorism/Separatist Terrorism: They ascertain socialist administrations in their position. Basically, they try to strike the established arrangement to exert their influence (Greenberg & Clifford 2015). Naxalites in seven-sister states in the north-east of India are following the Maoist ideology and creating turmoil in the whole region. (Elahi, 2009. 2010). This movement challenges the national sovereignty and

territorial integrity of the state. Active actors of this domain are known as insurgents or separatists who strive to seek freedom from the national body. Such type of terrorists group is the result of discrimination from the majority group in a nation state. They initiate fragmentation among people of a nation. They always try to disturb the establishment of a country. Baloch insurgency in Pakistan and Naxalite-Maoist insurgency in India are the major examples of this type of terrorism in South Asia.

Cyber terrorism: It involved advanced technology to attack people and misuse of information technology. Such terrorist use telecommunication system and computer system as a tool of weapons. This type of group disrupts the network system (Ahmad & Yunus 2012). They can hack the government financial information. Cyber terrorists is a great threat to telecommunication system and government network services. It is reported many times in Pakistan and India that some of their official websites are being hacked by the hacker across the border (Saul & Heath 2015).

Eco-terrorism: The on-going phenomenon of Climate change is the base of this type of terrorism. This is one of the unique type of terrorism wherein all the industrial and developed nations are proliferating human suffering by carbonizing the environment. Consequently, under-developed poor economies of the world are facing the menace of it in the shape of droughts, floods, melting of glaciers, deforestation, extinction of wild life, animals and worsened the natural environment. India is the third largest emitter of carbon in the air that has adverse effects on the south Asian's environment. (Abrahamsen & Williams 2010).

Nuclear and Bio terrorism: This type of terrorism is extremely dangerous. It pertains the exploitation of nuclear material. Terrorist groups used to purchase nuclear weapon or attack on nuclear facilities. Such terrorist groups also try to spread nuclear radiation in the environment to affect people (Levi 2009; Frost 2020)

Bio-terrorism refers to the deliberate use of biological components, such as bacteria, viruses and toxins to create fear, or disruption among a population (Christian 2013). It is a form of terrorism that poses unique challenges due to its potential for widespread harm, difficulties in detection, and the need for specialized expertise. Bioterrorism can manifest through various means, including the release of infectious agents or toxins in public spaces, contaminated food or water supplies, or even the manipulation of biotechnology for harmful purposes (Lim, Simpson, Kearns & Kramer 2005). Recent outbreak of Covid-19 could also be an example of this.

Causes of Terrorism and Extremism in Pakistan

There have been many causes which lead to extremism and terrorist activities. These may include religio-political reasons to socio-economic ones. Poverty, social inequality, political victimization, banned literature, non-fulfillment of basic needs of people hailing from certain areas, external intervention and funding, inter-state issues and terror funding are few of the major causes leading towards extremism and terrorism. Due to complex trans-national and ethno-sectarian fault lines few segments of society are more prone towards extremist ideologies. These terrorist organizations, work at both micro and macro levels, having highly skilled technical experts, which make them more deadly, as they have latest technology access and availability of dangerous weapons is not an issue for them. They play with the religious sentiments of common people and get funding in the name of charity and alms, which is ultimately used for terror financing at both national and international levels. Crimes like drug trafficking, human trafficking, illegal arms trade and money laundering play a vital role in global and intercontinental spread of extremist ideologies and terrorist activities. Their outreach is phenomenal due to technological advancement. Therefore, this problem sees no borders and has become

an international issue, needing to have a holistic approach by all nations. For the last few decades, ethnic and religious activities have been one of the major strategies used by terrorist organizations (Charles T. p-10). Whenever, there is an opposition of established and general values, such opposition may be associated with the extremism. The factors are complex and intricate, as there can never be any single cause to extremism, however, unemployment, illiteracy, lack of patience i.e. intolerance, disparity in socio-economic status of communities, poverty, marginalization of some communities within the state, non-availability of basic health and educational facilities, distorted interpretations of Sharia and Islam and class differences are some of the main factors which contribute towards spreading and attracting to such extremist ideologies. Sometimes, this leads to either religious extremism or ethno-nationalist extremism. Where, if we talk of Pakistan, religious extremism can be traced from 1970s Afghan jihad after which Mullahization and sectarianism got hold of state; whereas, usually ethno-nationalist extremism only happens when state does not pay heed to basic needs and justified demands of people of marginalized areas or certain marginalized communities and they become prone to extremist ideologies, being most vulnerable. The ultimate result is disorder in the society, which affects tourism industry, tranquility of society, economic downfall, halting educational activities and worsens international relations of the state. Such a situation demands, proactive efforts from the state machinery and quick response from the society. There have been push and pull factors playing their role into this, where bad governance, human rights violations, corruption and social marginalization are push factors and pull factors affect directly on individual level like radicalization and extremism through sense of belonging, availability of materials, social status and peer pressure, adventure, sense of self-esteem and victimization. Marginalization can lead them to the feeling that they are making history, which will lead them to glory and fame (USAID Policy, p-5).

Pakistan's Counter Terrorism and Extremism Efforts

The extremism and ultimately terrorism has affected Pakistan, more than any other state. This is mainly due to the decision taken by the then state machinery to become front line state in war on terror and providing air, land and water route to coalition forces. Although this logistical support helped international community in countering terrorism, yet it affected badly when it comes to the domestic security of Pakistan. Pakistan become vulnerable and suffered a lot economically, politically, socially and thousands of innocent people lost their lives as a result. Our military is ever since engaged in countering terrorism. India as a neighbor has played a suspicious role throughout, whereas, Afghanistan has not been stable ever since and border situation at Pak-Afghan border has also helped the influx of terrorists into the state.

Due to their physical features and cross border ties, it becomes next to impossible to recognize those terrorists, which helps them restructuring and regrouping again and again, establishing sleeping cells in the tribal areas for terrorist activities in Pakistan. The incidents like, red mosque (lal masjid) 2007 and Bait Ullah Mehsud's announcement of TTP's presence in Pakistan, whereas, Pakistan banning TTP in 2008 by freezing their assets, are some of the examples in this regard. These terrorists have been involved in suicide bombing as well as, preplanned attacks on designated targets. The intensity of these attacks led to national consensus and Zarb-e-Azab operation was completed in North Waziristan. After that Operation Rah-e-Rast (Swat) and Rah-e-Nijat (South Waziristan) in 2009 were also completed. Alongside these, countless drone attacks and aerial bombing were carried out in FATA areas. In 2013 elections this bombing or not, became an electoral issue. As per Michael C & Valentina S (p-24) these operations not only stopped Pakistani Taliban but also squeezed Al-Qaida's operating space. It is pertinent to mention here that before September 11 suicide attacks were rarely recorded

in Pakistan, but after a September 11 more than 400 suicide attacks were recorded, resulting into thousands of casualties and injuries. Rest of the counter terrorism operations included; operation Sherdil, operation Black Thunderstorm, operation Koh-e-Safaid, operation Zalzal and operation Al-Mezan along-with few minor operations, which took place over the past 2 decades.

These counter terrorism efforts do not only need wiping out of terrorists from certain areas, but also rehabilitation of those who surrender and resettlement of IDPs is also important for longer results. These demand drastic reforms in existing policies and laws, like revision of curriculum at all levels to inculcate tolerance and eradicate religious extremism and hatred, madrassa reforms and reforms in banking sector to restrict and if possible eradicate terror financing are few of the steps taken by Pakistan. A comprehensive National Action Plan (with 20 points) has also been issued for revamping police system, trainings for counter terrorism, intelligence sharing and implementation of integrated and unified strategy. Establishment of National Counter Terrorism Authority (via 2013 Act) and Protection of Pakistan Act 2014 are also hallmarks in this regard, which ensure speedy trial as well as, establishment of military courts was also a time bound measure taken to fight terrorism. There have been huge losses for Pakistan in terms of economy, social fabric, infrastructure and human lives. International community was required to acknowledge these efforts, but to the opposite, Pakistan was required to do more, which further resulted into more destruction and more terrorist attacks.

Conclusion

It can be stated that extremism does not stem from a single cause; it has multifarious root causes, which can be religious, economic, socio-cultural or political. The players spreading extremist ideologies with the state might be internal as well as, external. Hence, state needs to understand the needs of marginalized groups and identities alongside lessening the economic divide among different areas within its sovereignty. The newer version of terrorism cannot be countered by old techniques, for that pragmatic domestic and foreign policy, as well as, modern counter terrorism techniques and mechanisms are to be adopted, alongside intelligence sharing and regional cooperation. Extremism, which is one of the root causes, of terrorism has also to be addressed through education, training, psychological training and socio-political integration of marginalized classes.

The failure to celebrate and promote the values which can stop extremism is evident in state policies; a positive defense of such values is regarded as a necessary part of the battle of ideas against extremism (Kundani, A. 2015). It should be noted that this extremism issue is an issue of human behavior, and to tackle this Pakistan will have to start a public campaign in which journalists, academicians, general public, civil society, commentators, politicians and all segments of society will have to play their positive role; otherwise this issue will continue to pose a serious threat to its national security and its effects will be unbearable, as we experienced in 1971 in the shape of disintegration of our homeland. To curb extremism in Pakistan government needs to understand the importance of partnership with the stake-holders with enhanced engagement with different identities and different institutions at both domestic and international level. Thomas Barnett, a US author and former national security strategist, once described Islamist terrorism and extremism as the desperate reaction of a small group to a world that is modernizing at a bewildering pace. The West's response should be characterized by strategic patience not self-destructive over reaction (Kundani, 2015).

For countering terrorism good governance is of vital importance, alongside joint efforts from political and law enforcing forces and structural reforms in this regard to

prevent and combat extremist ideologies and terrorist attacks. One cannot deny the importance of regional cooperation in terms of security and intelligence sharing for better results.

Pakistan's commitment to eradicate terrorism is firm and its first priority for few coming years, as this part of the world will remain center for terrorist activities in near future. Apart from application of military power against terrorist individuals and entities there is need for a whole range of non-military measures to achieve the objective. Pakistani nation has suffered a lot and has come to the consensus that neither it will allow terrorism at its soil, nor it will allow its soil to be used against any other country for such activities. Pakistan is not only affected by the mammoth of extremism and terrorism problem, but it wants to be a part to the solution too. Therefore, it has always advocated an all-inclusive regional and international approach to address the causes of terrorism in and around Pakistan, and indeed the entire world. In this regard, it needs a proactive approach rather than a reactive one. The more patient response will be there and the more skillfully and tactfully the situation will be handled, the better results will ensue, as the threat to national security is real, imminent and potent.

Recommendations

Counter terrorism is not an individual's task, it required beyond borders cooperation in terms of logistics, financials, expertise and intelligence sharing. The dialogue at every level becomes the only solution when there is internal destruction in a state. State needs to understand the demands of those who are marginalized and resolve the ethno-sectarian differences, otherwise such people become easy prey to the terrorist training cells. There has been need for international cooperation and information sharing throughout. On the other hand, at domestic level basic aim should be to eradicate the underlying causes which lead to such activities. The extremist ideologies must be curbed, which are the major cause of terrorism, especially in Pakistan. Hence, a proper planning to counter extremism would be to:-

1. Focus on the drivers which lead to extremism
2. Promotion of nationalism among masses esp. those segments which have been marginalized
3. Bringing entrepreneurial approach into the local environment by continuing successful approaches and discontinuation of ineffective instruments
4. To consider transnational strategies as majority of times cross border coordination drives extremism
5. Introduction of innovation, flexibility, agility, evaluation and learning, into policies
6. Coordinated communication among its partners at both domestic and international level for informed risk taking and experimentation with intensive management.

Hence, the policy makers of Pakistan need to devise policies not only to curb this issue, but also to work on root causes of extremism, as without eliminating the root causes no policy can be effectively implemented. In this regard following recommendations can be made i.e.

1. Academicians and spiritual leaders should play their role in curbing this issue through their writings and speeches, in order to change the mind-set.
2. Civil society and media must come forward for positive image building.
3. A uniform educational system should be introduced, as our education is actually dividing us into different classes.
4. Marginalized identities must be brought into main stream by redressing their grievances.
5. Religious rigidness and fanaticism must be washed out through promoting cultural harmony and tolerance.
6. Speedy justice system is a key to eliminate this issue. So, judicial reforms be introduced without wasting further time.
7. Political and religious lives of certain leaders, who have influence on masses, be monitored on regular basis.
8. Laws must be amended to criminalize individuals or groups for expressing extremist opinions i.e. anti-extremist legislation be introduced.
9. Removal of on-line content deemed extremist.
10. There must be some '*de-extrimisation*' programs for individuals to bring them into main stream.
11. State must fund specific political, religious, social, ethnic as well as, media personnel to promote an ideological message against extremism.

References

- Abrahamsen, R., & Williams, M. (2010). "Security beyond the state: Global security assemblages in international politics". *International Political Sociology*, 4(1), 1-17. 2.
- Ahmad, R., & Yunus, Z. (2012). A dynamic cyber terrorism framework. *International Journal of Computer Science and Information Security*, 10(2), 149.
- Charles Tilly (2004). *Terror, Terrorism, Terrorists. Sociological Theory*, XXII (1), Theories of Terrorism: A Symposium, pp-5-13.
- Christian, M. D. (2013). Biowarfare and bioterrorism. *Critical Care Clinics*, 29(3), 717-756.
- Elahi, Muhammad Manzoor, (2009). "Naxalite-Maoist Insurgency in India" (Part I), Issue: December, *India Desk*. Pakistan Study Center, University of the Punjab.
- Elahi, Muhammad Manzoor, (2010). "Naxalite-Maoist Insurgency in India" (Part II), Issue: January *India Desk*. Pakistan Study Center, University of the Punjab.
- Frost, R. M. (2020). *Nuclear terrorism after 9/11*. Routledge.
- Greenberg, J., & Clifford, B. (2015). Extremism on the left. In A. Silke (Ed.), *The Routledge Handbook of Terrorism and Counterterrorism* (321-335). Routledge.
- Hugo Brady (n.d.) *Intelligence, Emergencies and Foreign Policy: The EU's Role in Counter-Terrorism*. A
- Iqbal, M. Z. (2010). An appraisal of the Afghanistan-Pakistan strategy to counter terrorism. *The US Army War College Quarterly: Parameters*, 40(2), 6.
- Isabelle Duyvesteyn (2004) How *New is the New Terrorism?* *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism*, 27:5, 439-454, DOI: 10.1080/10576100490483750.
- Islam, Z., Adnan, M., & Talpur, M. A. (2020). Pakistan's counter-terrorism strategy with viable recommendations. *Progressive Research Journal of Arts & Humanities (PRJAH)*, 2(2), 155-167.
- Kaplan, A. (2017). *The counter-terrorism puzzle: A guide for decision makers*. Routledge.
- Kavosh, R. (2015). Religious terrorism. *Andalus Journal of International Studies (AJIS)*, 1(2), 152-167.
- Khalid, I., & Roy, M. I. (2016). Pakistan's military operations: the counter terrorism strategy (2001-2013) prospects and implications. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 53(2).
- Kimberly A Powel (2011) *Framing Islam: An Analysis of US Media Coverage of Terrorism Since 9/11*, *Communication Studies*, 62:1, 90-112, DOI: 10.1080/10510974.2011.533599
- Levi, M. (2009). *On nuclear terrorism*. Harvard University Press.
- Lim, D. V., Simpson, J. M., Kearns, E. A., & Kramer, M. F. (2005). Current and developing technologies for monitoring agents of bioterrorism and biowarfare. *Clinical microbiology reviews*, 18(4), 583-607.
- Lygutas, A. (2009). Rights in the Context of Counter-Terrorism Measures: United States of America. *Jurisprudencija*, 117(3), 145-161.

- Mehdi M. Nia (2010). From Old to New Terrorism: The Changing Nature of International Security, *Globality Studies Journal, Issue 18*, pp-1-12.
- Michael Clarke & Valentina Soria (2010). Terrorism, *The RUSI Journal, 155, 4*, 24-31, DOI: 10.1080/03071847.2010.514103
- Miller, S. (2009). *Terrorism and Counter: Terrorism*. Wiley-Blackwell.
- Mubashra, S. (2018). The impact of counter-terrorism effectiveness on economic growth of Pakistan: An econometric analysis.
- Prof. Kundani, A. (2015). *A Decade Lost: Rethinking Radicalization & Extremism*
- Rafique, N., & Manan, A. (2019). Countering Measures of Terrorism in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Research, 2(02)*, 61-75.
- Report of Task Force on Tackling Radicalization and Extremism.*
- Saul, B., & Heath, K. (2015). Cyber terrorism. *Research Handbook On International Law And Cyberspace*, N. Tsagourias and R. Buchan, eds., Edward Elgar.
- Sedgwick, M. (2004). Al-Qaeda and the nature of religious terrorism. *Terrorism and Political Violence, 16(4)*, 795-814.
- USAID Policy (2011). *The Development Response to Violent Extremism and Insurgency: Putting Principles into Practice*
- Zahid Hussain (2015). *The New 'War on Terror'*. The Dawn.