



RESEARCH PAPER

Contributions of the Governments of Z.A Bhutto and Benazir Bhutto For establishing Good Governance in Pakistan

¹Dr. Shahida Begum* ²Akhlaque Hussain and* ³Israr Ahmed

1. Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur, Sindh, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur, Sindh, Pakistan
3. M.Phil. Scholar Department of Political Science Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur, Sindh, Pakistan

***Corresponding Author** shahida.chandio@salu.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

The objective of this research paper described and explored the efforts of Bhutto's governments towards the good governance as per the criteria World Bank. Good governance-the major issue of Pakistan was not handled properly. After the death of the Father of Nation Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto emerged as the most popular leader in West Pakistan. Bhutto came in power in 1971 and gave a constitution to country but unfortunately he ousted from power corridor by Army Chief General Zia in 1977. Contributions of Z. A. Bhutto's government for establishing good governance through the participation of representatives of people in decision making process. Transparency and Accountability of representatives and bureaucracy were introduced. Easy approach of common citizens towards the government institutions is launched. Socio-Economic and Political reforms were adopted as per the interest of people. Z A Bhutto's daughter Benazir Bhutto, twice served as Prime Minister, first from November 1988 to August 1990 and second time from October 1993 to November 1996. The periods of government of both Bhutto's government regarded as a milestone towards the democracy and democracy is the key factor of good governance. Benazir Bhutto continued policy of his father especially for the participation of peoples in this regard she emphasized on women participation and representation in every walk of life. This is paper would analyze the data collected by using qualitative and descriptive methods of research to analyze the achievements and the failures of the governments of Bhutto d and Benazir Bhutto for establishing good governance in the country.

KEYWORDS Good Governance, Martial Law, Reforms, Democracy, Violence

Introduction

Governance implies the possession and the exercise of authority in the best interest of the state and its citizens. It is for the welfare of the people. Good Governance brings prosperity through developing economy and prevails peace and stability. It provides guarantee to safety and security of all the citizens; fosters democracy and makes the country independent and sovereign internally and externally. Rule of law, justice, fairness, transparency, people's participation, basic freedoms, accountability and public sector management are essential attributes of good governance.

Pakistan was formed on August 14, 1947 after the long democratic struggle of the Muslims of the sub-Continent.

"The Pakistan Constituent Assembly, which would act as both the federal legislature and the constitution making body, began its opening session on 11 August

(1947). "Now if we want to make this great State of Pakistan happy and prosperous we should wholly and solely concentrate on the well-being of the people, and especially of the masses and the poor," directed the Quaid-i-Azam (the Great Leader) Muhammad Ali Jinnah. In the same speech he called for freedom for all religious groups and he condemned bribery, corruption, nepotism and jobbery." (Hussain, 2017)

After the death of Governor General Muhammad Ali Jinnah on September 11, 1948, Pakistan faced issues of governance. Less attention was paid towards developing institutions, controlling corruption, providing basic necessities to the people, access to justice, and developing economy etc. Political leadership's main achievement was the formation of the first constitution of 1956. Agriculture-the major sector of economy was deprived of proper planning. Hence, production of food stuff was decreased.

On October 7, 1958, democracy was derailed by President Iskandar Mirza. Martial was imposed under Field Marshal General Muhammad Ayub Khan. On October 27, 1958 President Iskandar Mirza was ousted and General Muhammad Ayub Khan took over the government. After Ayub Khan, Army Chief General Muhammad Yahya Khan ruled the country from March 1969 to December 1971.

Poor governance of Ayub Khan and Yahya Khan caused political unrest due to allowing less participation of the people in making decisions. Corrupt bureaucracy delayed in delivery of services. There occurred the misuse of resources, abuse of power and no proper accountability and justice. Elites were given priority. After general elections of 1970, political unrest and violence erupted in East Pakistan. India took the benefit of internal unrest of Pakistan and imposed war. On December 16, 1971 East Pakistan seceded from Pakistan and became Bangladesh. Lack of good governance caused the disintegration of the country after its formation of twenty four years.

After the separation of East Pakistan military ruler invite Bhutto to take over the reign of the government of rest Pakistan. Military ruler invited Bhutto because after separation of Bengal Bhutto was the leader of majority party.

Z A Bhutto introduced new constitution and introduced many reforms in the interest of common people. Bhutto ousted by military coup -data of general Zia in July 1977. Zia stay in power till his death. After the death of General Muhammad Zia ul Haq general elections were held in 1988. Once again Pakistan people's party of Z A Bhutto won the majority seats of national Assembly and Benazir Bhutto daughter of Z A Bhutto became prime minister of country. She also took measures towards good governance.

Material and Methods

The research methodology is very important step of a research study. In this study the qualitative and descriptive method of research are used. This research is based on history of governance in Pakistan. In this regards the historical method of research is also used.

Government of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto (1971-1977)

In the general elections of 1970 Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto's Pakistan People's Party had won the largest number of seats of National Assembly from West Pakistan. After secession of East Pakistan, the responsibilities of President of Pakistan and civilian Chief Martial Law Administrator were given to Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto on December 20, 1971. Besides rebuilding of national confidence, Z.A. Bhutto struggled to maintain good

governance in the war-trodden country. President Z. A. Bhutto got vote of confidence during the first session of National Assembly on April 14, 1972.

Bhutto introduced presidential form in Centre and parliamentary system in provinces under Interim Constitution which was passed by National Assembly on April 17, 1972. Martial Law was lifted on April 21, 1972.

In July 1972 language riots erupted in Sindh's capital Karachi, and in city Hyderabad in which Muhammad Usman Gabol son of Muhammad Ali Gabol PPP's MPA Sindh, Feroz Gabol, Abdul Razzaque Soomro and others were killed.

G. M. Syed, the architect of modern Sindhi Nationalism, was kept under house arrest in August 1972.

President Bhutto succeeded in holding talks with Indian Prime Minister Indra Gandhi at Simla in 1972. Bhutto got Pakistani occupied areas back from India and got free more than 93,000 soldiers and civilians from Indian custody.

Defence

Strengthening Pakistan's defence was given top priority by Z. A. Bhutto, the founder of Pakistan's nuclear program. "On 20 January 1972, barely a month after assuming power, Bhutto convened a conference of nuclear scientists in Multan to discuss the possibility of initiating a nuclear weapons program." (Salik,2015)

Later, Pakistan held talks with France for obtaining reprocessing plant. Formal agreement regarding Nuclear technology was signed between Pakistan, France and International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA). Karachi Nuclear Power Plant and Kahuta facility were main the achievements of Z. A. Bhutto government.

Reforms of Z. A. Bhutto Government for Good Governance

Government of Z. A. Bhutto launched following reforms for establishing good governance in the country:

Reforms for Education and Health

Bhutto's Educational policy of 1972 "stated the vision of education as 'ensuring the preservation, promotion and practice of the basic ideology of Pakistan and making it a code of individual and national life.'" (Siddiqui, 2017)

Schools and colleges were nationalized. Government decided to provide free education up to secondary level in 1974. Some other contributions for education sector were establishment of University Grants Commission and National Book Foundation.

Bhutto government took measures to provide free health facilities to all the citizens. New Medical colleges and hospitals were established throughout the country.

Reforms for Agriculture and Industries

Policy of nationalizing the industries was adopted from January 1972. Bhutto's agenda for maintaining good governance was through developing economy on socialistic structure. Bhutto faced following inherited problems related to development of economy:

“To reconstruct the depressed and the war affected economy of Pakistan (West Pakistan); (2) The recessionary tendencies in agriculture and industrial sector; (3) The search for new markets, particularly for textile after separation of East Pakistan; (4) Severe deficit in BOP; and (5) The MF's pressure to devalue rupee.”(Shahid ,1995)

In 1972 ceilings of landownership fixed to 150 acres for irrigated and 300 acres of un-irrigated land respectively. In 1977 it was decreased at 100 acres and 150 acres respectively.

Workers were allowed to form and function trade unions. Funds, bonus, fix monthly salary, residential facilities and social security were provided to workers under Labor Reforms. Labor class went to countries of Middle East for earning livelihood. Support prices of agriculture outputs, devaluation and other measures of Bhutto government brought prosperity for the common people and it reduced the benefits of the privileged class.

Corruption

For discouraging malpractices in the public sector, on March 10, 1972 Martial Law Regulation was enforced. More than 1300 government servants were terminated from their jobs who were found guilty in misuse of funds and corruption.

Growth in economy was for the Poor people:

Economic growth ratio was not proved good during 1973 to 77 due to rise in oil prices, floods in Pakistan and other reasons but mostly the benefits went to the majority of the population i.e. the poor people. During 1972-77 the program of socialism increased jobs. The poor people benefited from distribution of income. Hence, Z.A. Bhutto became the Quaid-i-Awam (means the Leader of the People). Bureaucracy in collusion with industrialists and landlords hindered the production of industries.

Growth in economy from 1972-77 was “Real GDP 4.4 per cent, Agriculture 2.4 per cent, Industry 4.5 per cent and Services 6.3 per cent.” (Hussain, 2018)

All private sector banks and insurance companies were also nationalized. State Life Insurance Corporation was formed.

Issues of Federalism

Pakistan faced the crisis of federalism since its inception. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto's government responded the issues of federalism through introducing permanent Constitution of 1973 on August 14, 1973 and “at the same time, fiscal federalism took the shape of a progressive march towards a share-out of resources between the Centre and the provinces.

The people of smaller provinces expressed concerns over allocating seats on population basis in the National Assembly and including concurrent list under the joint responsibility of the federal government and the provinces in addition to the list of subjects in the constitution for federal subjects under the responsibility of federal government.

Meeting the demands of smaller provinces the parliament was made bicameral. Seats of National Assembly (Lower House) allocated on basis of population. All provinces were allocated equal number of seats in the Senate (Upper House). It was

decided that concurrent list would not exist more after ten years. (After long period of 37 years the parliament passed 18th Amendment to the Constitution of 1973 in 2010.)

Political Disturbances caused the Fall of Z. A. Bhutto

Dismissal of Chief Minister of Balochistan Sardar Attaullah Khan Mengal in 1973 resulted in outburst of violence in Balochistan. Balochistan's untoward political unrest left impressions on the politics of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Chief Minister of KP Mufti Mehmood resigned in protest over removal of Balochistan government.

In Balochistan, operation was launched from May 1973. Major centres of insurgency were areas of Mengal and Mari tribesmen. Hundreds of civilians were killed and a large number of Baloch families migrated either to other provinces in Pakistan or to Afghanistan. "The Pakistan military suffered 3,300 casualties and the Baluch guerrillas 5,300." (Saeed, 1980)

Hayat Muhammad Khan Sherpao of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa was assassinated in February 1975. A large number of senior leaders and workers of National Awami Party and other opposition parties were arrested. Some of them included: Abdul Wali Khan, Sardar Attaullah Khan Mengal, Arbab Sikandar Khalil, Ghous Bakhsh Bizanjo, Nawab Khair Bakhsh Mari, Dr. Abdul Hayee Baloch, Habib Jalib, Usman Baloch, Yousuf Masti Khan, Sher Muhammad Mari, Qasur Gardezi and others. Actions of Federal Security Force were criticized by the opposition.

After Prime Minister Bhutto's announcement of holding general elections in March 1977, the Opposition parties united in Pakistan National Alliance (PNA). These parties were Pakistan Muslim League (Pir Pagara), National Democratic Party, Khaksar Tehreek, Jamaat-i-Islami, Pakistan Jamhuri Party, Jammiat-e-Ulema-i-Pakistan, and Jammiat-e-Ulema-i-Islam

General elections for the seats of National Assembly held on March 7, 1977. According to results of the elections of National Assembly, the independent candidates won 19 seats, PNA 36 seats and PPP obtained 155 seats out of 200 seats. The government of Z. A. Bhutto was accused of rigging the elections of National Assembly by parties of PNA. Provincial elections of March 10, 1977 were boycotted. PNA led countrywide agitation.

Dialogues held between both the government and the opposition/PNA and finally Z. A. Bhutto announced on July 4, 1977 that the agreement would be signed on July 5, 1977. But Army Chief General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haq took the benefit of political disturbance. The Government of Z. A. Bhutto was overthrown on July 5, 1977. Martial Law was declared. Parliament was dissolved. Constitution of 1973 was suspended and the Laws (Continuance in Force) Order 1977 was enforced. Judiciary was restricted from exercising its power of writ jurisdiction. Political activities were banned.

Z. A. Bhutto and senior leaders were put in jail. Disqualification Tribunals were established which started trials against former cabinet members, provincial ministers, governors and other law makers. Some of them included: Abdul Hafeez Pirzada, Abdul Sattar Khan Gabol, Sheikh Rasheed Ahmad, Nasrullah Khan Khattak, Sadiq Hussain Qureshi, Ghous Bakhsh Raisani, Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti, Jam Ghulam Qadir, Syed Qaim Ali Shah, Makhdoom Amin Faheem and others. Many politicians were disqualified for the period of seven years.

Z. A. Bhutto was released on July 29, 1977. Zia was afraid of his popularity and Bhutto was again arrested on September 3, 1977 but after ten days High Court Lahore released Bhutto on bail. After that, Z. A. Bhutto was arrested in murder case of Muhammad Ahmad Khan Kasuri.

General Zia allowed political activities on August 1, 1977 and gained political assistance from PNA parties through inducting their senior cadre leaders in his cabinet.

On March 18, 1978 High Court Lahore awarded death sentence to Z. A. Bhutto in a murder case of Muhammad Ahmad Khan Kasuri. On September 16, 1978 General Zia took an oath of the office of President under President's Succession Order, 1978. Under charges of abuse of power and malpractices, a large number of former people's representatives were debarred from holding public offices by Disqualification Tribunals.

The death sentence of High Court Lahore was upheld by the Supreme Court of Pakistan in an appeal filed by Z.A. Bhutto and the sentence was executed on April 4, 1979. Nusrat Bhutto and Benazir Bhutto were in jail. They were not allowed to receive or see the dead body of Bhutto. Protests and shutter down strikes were observed throughout Pakistan over hanging of Z. A. Bhutto to death.

Zia's Policies

General Zia adopted the policy of denationalization, privatization and Islamisation. Zia's some measures for Islamization included: Hudood Ordinance, 1979, Adultery (Zina) Ordinance 1979, Blasphemy laws and Ehtram-e-Ramzan Ordinance and establishment of Federal Shariat Court.

Zia gave priority to the elections of local Government instead of holding the general elections in the country. PNA parties differed with Zia and joined PPP-led Movement for the Restoration of Democracy (MRD) which was formed on February 6, 1981. MRD Movement started from August 14, 1983 for the restoration of democracy in the country. Political workers were imprisoned in thousands. MRD workers were tortured. Sindh proved to be the centre for MRD struggle where several MRD protestors were killed by Law Enforcement Agencies. All the jails in the province of Sindh were full with MRD protestors and no place was available to accommodate the people arrested in the MRD Movement. Human rights were violated.

Under pressure of MRD, Zia held non-party based general elections in February 1985. Muhammad Khan Junejo became Prime Minister who was dismissed on May 29, 1988 and National Assembly was dissolved by President General Zia-ul-Haq.

"Serious differences developed between the two over the signing of Geneva Accord in 1988 which set the stage for the with-drawl of the Red Army from Afghanistan. Furthermore, the blast occurring at Ojhri Camp in Rawalpindi in 1988...Junejo ordered the enquiry into the incident which Zia resisted--this proved to be the last straw." (Jalal, 2016)

President General Zia-ul-Haq died in an aircraft incident on August 17, 1988. Ghulam Ishaque Khan, Chairman Senate, became acting President.

Governments of Benazir Bhutto (November 1988 to August 1990 and October 1993 to November 1996)

Elections of National Assembly held on November 16, and for Provincial Assemblies on November 19, 1988 respectively. PPP emerged as the largest party with obtaining 94 seats of National Assembly out of 207 seats. Islami Jamhoori Ittehad (IJI)-an alliance of nine parties won 54 seats and emerged as the second largest party. In three provinces PPP succeeded to form governments except Punjab.

Benazir Bhutto, the leader of Pakistan People's Party, was invited on December 01, 1988 by acting President Ghulam Ishaq Khan. Benazir Bhutto became the first lady Prime Minister of Pakistan and in the countries of the Muslims.

The military and bureaucracy recognized Bhutto as a legitimate leader on these condition. The President of Pakistan would be Ghulam Ishaq Khan for a full term of five years; The Minister of Foreign Affairs would be of Zia to ensure the continuity of Zia's Afghan policy; and there would not be any interference in internal military affairs or the defense budget.

Presidential elections held on December 12, 1988. Ghulam Ishaq Khan was supported by PPP who had won the election and Nawabzada Nasrullah Khan was defeated.

Benazir Bhutto tried to maintain good governance. She allowed basic freedoms and released the political prisoners implicated in minor cases. Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto allowed trade unions and students unions.

PPP's provincial coalition governments existed in three provinces i.e. Sindh, Baluchistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. In December 1988 Baluchistan Assembly was dissolved by Governor of Balochistan. Benazir Bhutto condemned the Governor's decision and said it was conspiracy against democracy. Baluchistan Assembly was restored by Baluchistan High Court. Punjab's government was under IJI leader Nawaz Sharif who was the key opponent of Benazir Bhutto's government.

Benazir Bhutto took measures to strengthen industrial sector and adopted the policy of liberalization.

"In 1989, the new Pakistan People's Party government led by Benazir Bhutto established a Board of Investment which had the responsibility of laying down policy guidelines affecting industry. An Industrial Policy Statement was issued which increased the sanctioning limit for new investment to Rs.1 billion and simplified and streamlined the licensing process. More over a list of 'key industries' was introduced, including the engineering, fertilizer, and electronic industries, and these units were given tax holidays and exemptions from custom duties." (Hussain, 2011)

People's Program was started. Measures were taken to reduce the level of poverty through developing agriculture and industry. Employments were given to the educated and skilled professional youths. Poverty ratio decreased 3.4 per cent from 1987-88. In 1990-91 poverty in Pakistan was 34 per cent.

Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto faced certain challenges during 20 month rule. Combined opposition failed in ousting Benazir Bhutto through moving no confidence motion in the National Assembly. The infamous 'operation midnight jackal' was launched.

“The allies of the PPP the ANP in Frontier (KP) and the MQM in Sindh were persuaded by (President) Ishaq to break away from the coalition.....Law and order problems were created disturbing normal life in Sindh particularly in Karachi. Business suffered and production began to decline. The only supreme objective before the establishment was to get rid of Benazir’s government. When all intrigues failed Ishaq thought it was time to make the decisive move. He used the draconian powers of the President under the 8th Amendment and dissolved the National assembly and dismissed the Benazir government (in August 1990).” (Riaz,2000)

All provincial assemblies were dissolved. Charges of abuse of power, corruption and poor governance were leveled against the government of Benazir Bhutto.

In the period of caretaker Prime Minister Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi, certain measures were taken to control corruption. Courts were set up for trials of cases of corruption.

Interim Prime Minister Jatoi held general elections on October 24, 1990. Pakistan Democratic Alliance (PDA) was formed by PPP and some other parties to contest the election.

Islami Jamhoori Ittehad (IJI)-an alliance of nine political parties including Pakistan Muslim League, won the largest number of seats in the National Assembly. Nawaz Sharif, the leader of Islami Jamhoori Ittehad (IJI) became Prime Minister on November 01, 1990. Under the charges of corruption and mismanagement, the government of Nawaz Sharif was dismissed and National Assembly was dissolved on April 18, 1993 by President Ghulam Ishaq Khan. Balakh Sher Mazari was appointed as caretaker Prime Minister. But the Supreme Court set aside the decision of President and restored the Nawaz government on May 26, 1993. After the restoration of Nawaz government by the Supreme Court, the relations of the Prime Minister and President never improved. Finally, the both President Ghulam Ishaq Khan and the Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif resigned in July 1993.

Wasim Sajjad, Chairman of Senate, became an acting President. Moen Qureshi was appointed as Prime Minister of caretaker government.

On October 6, 1993 new elections held for the National and the Provincial Assemblies. On October 19, 1993 Benazir Bhutto, PPP leader, took an oath for the Office of Prime Minister. In the Presidential of November 13, 1993, the candidate of PPP Farooq Ahmad Laghari succeeded and became the President of Pakistan. Benazir tried to handle with the provincial issues through forming PPP led governments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in 1994 and in Punjab in 1995. MQM-led violent protests and strikes in Sindh’s capital Karachi and Nawaz led agitation engaged PPP government politically disturbed. “Brown Amendment” was passed by the US Senate on September 21, 1995. It eased the restrictions on Pakistan and foreign investors took interest in investing in Pakistan.

Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto government was criticized over the assassination of her brother Murtaza Bhutto in Karachi by Police in September, 1996 and appointment of adhoc judges to High Courts and Supreme Court.

On November 5, 1996 President Farooq Ahmad Laghari dismissed Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto on the charges of corruption, ethnic and sectarian violence, extra judicial killings and interference with the judiciary. National Assembly was dissolved. Benazir Bhutto, Asif Ali Zardari and other PPP leaders faced the cases of corruption.

Benazir Bhutto's democratic governments were not allowed to complete the tenure hence she could not succeed to establish good governance in the country. Benazir Bhutto was assassinated in Rawalpindi on December 27, 2007.

Conclusion

After Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the most popular leader was Z.A. Bhutto in Pakistan. After the separation of East Pakistan, the power was shifted to PPP's leader Z. A. Bhutto. Bhutto introduced administrative and economic reforms which resulted in the development of institutions and the poor people enjoyed most benefits in period of less growth of economy. Bhutto strengthened the federation through Constitution of 1973.

General elections of 1977 resulted in political unrest in the country. Army Chief General Zia-ul-Haq took the benefit from political turmoil and held power in 1977. Democracy was hindered. Zia's policies resulted in the growth of religious intolerance. Political violence, religious extremism, growth ratio in poverty put the country on the crossroads of political destabilization and economic downfall. Mostly all main stream political parties of the country united for restoration of democracy and launched the Movement under MRD in 1983.

After the death of General Zia, Benazir Bhutto came in power twice in 1988 and in 1993 general elections held in 1988. Similarly Benazir Bhutto keeping in mind the ideas of Z.A Bhutto she adopted the policy of liberalization. She allowed trade Unions and took the steps to reduce poverty level through the development in agriculture and industry. That was the reason the employment ratio was increased and poverty ratio decreased 3.4 per cent from 1987-88. In 1990-91 poverty in Pakistan was 34 per cent. In Bhutto government he introduced some policies for check and balance for services in government sector to control the corruption and he terminated more than 1300 government servants from their jobs who were involved in misuse of funds and corruption. In fact the accountability and transparency are the main parameters for good governance that was implemented in Bhutto's government.

Recommendations

Pakistan is facing lot of problems of governance in various aspects of life yet such as political, social and economic. These problems are due to lack of good governance until the basic elements of good governance like accountability transparency would not be implemented in public and private sectors the economy of Pakistan will not be stable and instability in economic sector seriously impact upon the socio-Political sector in the country.

References

- Bhutto, B. (1988). *Daughter of East*, Pocket Books in 2008
- Husain, I. (2011). *Pakistan the Economy of an Elitist State*, Oxford University Press, Karachi
- Hussain, I. (2018) *Governing the Ungovernable: Institutional Reforms for Democratic Governance*, Oxford University Press, Karachi,
- Hussain. J. (2017). *A History of the Peoples of Pakistan Towards Independence*, Oxford university Press, Karachi
- Jalal, A. (2016). *The Oxford Companion to Pakistani History*, , Oxford University Press, Karachi
- Raza, R. (1997). *Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and Pakisatn 1967-1977*, OUP.
- Riaz, B. (2000). *Blind Justice*, Lahore, Fiction House, .
- Salik, N. (2015). *Learning to Live with the Bomb-Pakistan: 1998-2016*, Oxford University press, Karachi.
- Sayeed, Khalid B. (1980) *Politics in Pakistan: The Nature and Direction of Change*, (New York, Praeger Publishers.
- Shahid, A. H. (1995). *The Economy of Pakistan*, Lahore, Ilmi Kitab Khana.
- Shaikh, A. M. (2000). *Benazir Bhutto : A Political Biography*, Orient Books Publishing House.
- Siddiqui, S. (2017). *Education Policies in Pakistan: Politics, Projections, and Practices*. Oxford Karachi.
- Wolport, S. (1993). *Zulfi Bhutto of Pakistan : his life and times*, Oxford University press.